Attachment 1 –A

#### UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I COMMUNITY COLLEGES

# ANNUAL INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAM REVIEW PROCEDURES, COMPONENTS, AND MEASURES

#### I. PROCEDURES

The following procedures have been developed to assure more consistent data collection practices in the compilation, analysis, and reporting of the minimum measures, and to use the Annual Instructional Program Review in the college and UHCC budget development processes:

- 1 The Quantitative Measures will use data from UH system sources such as the Operational Data Store (ODS), Management And Planning Support (MAPS), and system designated occupational outlook sources;
- 2 The Office of the Vice President for Community Colleges (OVPCC) shall by August 15<sup>th</sup> compile and distribute data to the colleges for the system required minimum set of Quantitative Measures;
- 3 The data used shall come from the fall semester of the prior academic year, except for the Program Budget Allocation, Graduation/Completion, Transfers, and Perkins Core Indicators which will be based on prior year annual end-of-academic-year reports. Quantitative measures for the two prior academic years shall be included with the Annual Instructional Program Review (total of three years of data) and;
- 4 Colleges will complete the Annual Instructional Program review by the end of the fall semester:
- 5 Completed Annual Instructional Program Reviews shall be posted on the college web site; and
- 6 Colleges will submit an electronic file to the Office of the OVPCC by December 15<sup>th</sup>, in the form and format requested by the Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs.

#### II. COMPONENTS AND MEASURES

At a minimum, each college Annual Instructional Program Review shall consist of the following components and measures. Colleges are free to use additional components and measures for their internal assessment process.

AUTO BODY REPAIR and PAINTING

(Program Name)

Introduction:

Program Mission Statement and brief description of the program including a listing of program level student learning outcomes.

The Auto Body Repair and Painting Program (ABRP Program) aligns itself with the concepts of as a learning-centered program as Maui Community College has designated its self as a learning-centered institution; and has also has incorporated the concept of a lifelong learner into the program curriculum to allow for additional non-traditional students to enroll in the program.

The Program is offered in a self-paced module format to fulfill the specific needs of the students. First, the self-paced module format fills the needs of students striving to obtain skills for entry-level employment in the trade upon receiving their Certificates of Achievement and Associate in Applied Science Degrees. Next, students that are currently employed and seeking to improve their skills in specific areas of the trade are satisfied, and ultimately continue on to receive their Certificates and Degrees from the ABRP Program. Finally students enrolling for self- knowledge also have their needs fulfilled. Instruction in the ABRP Program for all three types of students can be accomplished at the same time.

The ABRP Program allows students to enter in to the program in either the fall or spring semester and also have the opportunity to specialize in the two distinctive areas of the trade once the core subjects for the ABRP Program are mastered.

There are capstone modules for each of the four sections of the ABRP Program. For a student enrolled in the ABRP 20 (corrosion and dent repair) modules, their capstone module requires them to successfully complete an assigned repair on a live job on their own with minimal help from the instructor. A student enrolled in the ABRP 22 (refinishing) series of modules, must do a complete refinish on a live project on their own, again with minimal help from the instructor. Next, students enrolled in the ABRP 40 (major collision repair) series of modules work as a team and complete a major collision repair, (because of possible issues of liability, students apply their skills learned to an insurance total that is then disposed of when done) again with minimal help from the instructor. Finally for the ABRP 41 (minor collision repair) series of modules, the student must individually successfully complete a minor collision repair that encompasses all skills learned, again with minimal help from the instructor.

Part I. Quantitative Indicators for Program Review

### <u>Demand</u>

Occupational Demand (Career Technical Education Programs)

1. Annual new and replacement positions in the State

Over the past several years the Auto collision and Refinishing trade has seen continued growth, as there are many more vehicles are in need of repairs. Vehicle owners are repairing their older vehicles to keep it running for a while longer. This in turn causes the auto body repair and refinishing facilities having to hire both skilled and semi-skilled technicians to meet the demands to complete the ever increasing request for repairs. The attached 2008-09 Program Health indicates 126 positions state wide, an increase of about one hundred employees.

### 2. Annual new and replacement positions in the County

Though the number of positions listed for Maui County is still low in the demand indicator section, the Auto Collision and refinishing trade has also seen growth at a rapid rate here in the County of Maui, especially the island of Maui. As noted in the section above there has been an increase of vehicles to be repaired, both private and commercial (including the rental fleet) market. As noted in last years review, this has lead an increase in the number of collision repair facilities has over the last few years from three to five large (5 or more employees) shops, to now having eight to ten large shops and from about six to eight smaller shops to 16 or 18 smaller shops. This was confirmed with a member of my ABRP Program advisory committee, at our meeting during the spring semester of 2009. Also, many shops do not advertise for their employees; but have an ample amount of applications on hand or advertise through word of mouth when in need for additional employees. So the three positions open here on Maui may not be an accurate account of available jobs at any given time. In addition, many of our students do not seek employment at a body shop, but find employment at a related business, such as a glass repair facility, new and used auto parts stores and outlets, or an automotive paint supply store.

### 3. Number of majors

As noted on many occasions in the past, the number of majors has always been a weak point for the ABRP Program as many of the students enrolled are part-time students already working in the trade or a related trade, attending classes to improve their knowledge and skills. Other students are just feeling out the trade to see if they would like to make this trade a career. In my conversations with many of these students, they stated that they would prefer not declare themselves as majors in the program as they believed it would require a commitment from them to enroll full-time and complete all the required courses for a degree seeking student just to remain in the program. Most full-time students enrolled in the program usually declare themselves as majors in the program as they are working towards receiving their certificates and degrees from the program.

4. Student semester hours for program majors in all program classes

Even though there are students in the program, but as noted above many students choose to not register themselves as majors in the ABRP Program. So that tabulation is low.

5. Student semester hours for non-program majors in all program classes

The results are higher in the non-program majors section accounting of students, because as noted above many students would not declare themselves as program majors for fear of committing themselves to more than what they want.

6. Student Semester Hours for all program classes.

### 7. FTE program enrollment

The FTE program enrollment numbers are low due to the increase in enrollment of parttime students in the Fall Semester of 2008 and moderate enrollment in the Spring Semester of 2009.

### 8. Number of classes taught

The number of classes taught in the ABRP program is measured not only by the individual course listings, but also by the time periods for each class session. Students enroll in a specific module and for a specific time of which there is five offerings.

9. Determination of program's health based on demand (Healthy, Cautionary, or Unhealthy)

Unhealthy

#### Efficiency

10. Average class size

The ABRP usually has 75% to 100% filled classes during the five time sessions offered each semester. The average numbers of students for each class session is about 14 to 18 students. With 16 students closing the class.

11. Class fill rate

The ABRP Program had good enrollments for the Fall 2009 semester and was over enrolled for the Spring 2009 semester.

12. FTE of BOR appointed program faculty

The ABRP Program has one full-time faculty.

13. Student/Faculty Ratio

Refer to attached chart.

14. Number of Majors per FTE faculty

The number of program majors per FTE faculty is low due to the number of students that have decided not to or do not care about declaring the ABRP Program as a major. Refer to attached chart.

- Program Budget Allocation (Personnel, supplies and services, equipment)
- 16. Cost per Student Semester Hour
- 17. Number of classes that enroll less than ten students None

18. Determination of program's health based on Efficiency (Healthy, Cautionary, or Unhealthy)

Healthy

### **Effectiveness**

19. Persistence of majors fall to spring

Traditionally the persistence of program majors from the fall semester into the spring semester is usually at 50% or better. But beginning during the spring semester of the 2007-08 academic year and continuing through the 2008-09 academic year, many students chose to work longer hours at their places of employment and not returning to the program. Not only were majors lost, but also non-majors. The students that were working part-time were encouraged by their employers to work full-time hours because of the amount of work available.

20. Number of degrees and certificates earned (annual)

There was one graduate with a CA and an AAS Degree for the 2008-09 year. Again, there were numerous students who qualified for Completion Certificates and applied for them this academic year. On the positive side there should be several graduates by the end of the spring 2010 semester. But on the negative side, a number of the ABRP students enrolled in the program are not striving to receive a degree in the program. They are here for in-service training and only enroll in classes that they need for advancement. Others seek employment once they gain enough knowledge and skills of the auto body trade and never return to the program. When I visit the shops, I always see former non-completers from the ABRP still employed.

21. Number of students transferred (enrolled) to a four-year institution

None, that I am aware of.

Perkins core indicators (\*Career Technical Education programs only)

22. Academic Attainment (1P1)

100%

23. Technical Skill Attainment (1P2) \*

100%

24. Completion Rate (2P1)

There was one graduate for the academic year 2008-09. There also students that have completed their Certificate of Competence and have left the program.

25. Placement in Employment, Education, and Military (3P1)

Because of the continued high demand for auto collision and auto refinishing technicians here in the Maui County for most of Fall 2008 and Spring 2009, 80% all of the students that became employed while still enrolled in school are still working in the trade. Many of these students were recruited by body shops to begin working even though they have not completed or graduated from the program.

### 26. Retention in Employment (3P2)

Whether the student has received a degree or not from the program, once employed in industry tend to remain employed until they decided it is time for them to leave the trade. The majority of the ABRP Program former students, both completers and non-completers, are still gainfully employed in the auto collision repair trade. Several of the former students, again both completers and non-completers, have started their own repair facilities and do hire students from the ABRP Program.

## 27. Non Traditional Participation (4P1) \*

There were several non-traditional participants enrolled in the program during the 2008-09 academic school year.

### 28. Non Traditional Completion (4P2) \*

Many of the non-traditional participants attendance become sporadic and they do not complete the courses they have enrolled in, once they begin to do the required practical exercises in the laboratory. In discussion with these participants, their responses was that they did not realize how hard and the amount of physical labor involved to be able to weld and work on the automotive sheet metal, or to complete refinish a vehicle.

29. Determination of program's health based on effectiveness (Healthy, Cautionary, Unhealthy)

#### Cautionary

#### Part II. Analysis of the Program

Strengths and weaknesses in terms of demand, efficiency, and effectiveness based on an analysis of data.

The strength of the program is in the demand by industry for skilled and semi-skilled employees. We constantly receive requests for students for employment. A weakness, in my observation, is to retain the students in the program until they at least receive a certificate, a degree preferred, from the program.

Significant Program Actions (new certificates, stop-out; gain/loss of positions, results of prior year's action plan)

The implementation of IICAR curriculum into the ABRP Program was completed in the 2006-2007 academic year. Then there was the fine-tuning within the program to accommodate the II CAR curriculum to the ABRP Program for the academic year 2007-08. For the 2008-2009 academic year all the test and quizzes were being changed to meet IICAR and NATEF format. IICAR is an acronym for Inter-Industry Conference on Auto Collision Repair. They are a non-profit organization that works hand in hand with auto manufacturers, equipment manufactures, and product manufacturers to provide the latest information and training on collision and corrosion repairs, as well as refinishing procedures. They also provide guidance to NATEF for ASE Certification.

30. Determination of program's overall health (Healthy, Cautionary, Unhealthy)

Cautionary

Part III. Action plan

As noted previously, the problem of retaining students is at the forefront as a major issue for the ABRP Program. Even though a "user friendly format" for the module instructions for the students was developed during the summer of 2007, and redone during the summer of 2008 and again this past summer, it still is apparent that many students still need to have an instructor present to provide guidance in the classroom through out the semester.

Because of the exceeding high enrollment for the Fall Semester of 2008 and having to hire a lecturer to assist with the overload of students, several options became evident for student retention. One, have one instructor for all students while they are actively participating in laboratory exercises and one instructor for only classroom activities. This could have an impact on the retention of students in the program by being able to provide the one-on-one support needed, instead of being stretched thin between 16 students doing 16 different tasks or assignments. Or have one instructor for the first year students and another for the second year students. I believe either system will work, but the latter being a better choice as the instructor can spend more time with their specific group of students. Especially, for the first year students that require much more guidance and encouragement to remain in and to complete the program. This could possibly be the key or start the program in the right direction in dealing with the issue of student retention. At this time the Maui Community College ABRP Program is the only campus in the UH system that is a single faculty member ABRP Program.

Another avenue I have been exploring to aid in student retention and completion is to rearrange the ABRP Program methods of delivery for the modules. Each module would only be offered at a specific time during the semester or specific semesters and the modules must be completed during that time frame of the offering.

An effort to incorporate more computer skills related assignments, such as WEB CT instruction for certain subject areas related to auto body repair, students being able to take their test and guizzes on line is online as my next major project for the program.

Part IV. Resource Implications (physical, human, financial)

Funding for an additional faculty member or a full-time lecturer. As stated above, one instructor to provide instruction and supervision the laboratory while the other instructor is in the classroom working with students, or one instructor for the first year students and one for the second year students.

A major piece of equipment required at this point in time is a resistance spot welder that will be used during the instruction of the collision repair process. The resistance spot welder that the program had died of natural causes. Being old and well used, it could no longer produce quality spot welds. The welding equipment repair shop said that model is no longer in production, so the parts required for repair was not available.